APPENDIX H: FUQUA SCHOOL OF BUSINESS

In this Appendix:
Faculty Evaluation, Appointment, Promotion, and Tenure: Criteria and Procedures 1
Faculty Bylaws 8

Faculty Evaluation, Appointment, Promotion, and Tenure:
Criteria and Procedures

I. Faculty Titles and Standards
Faculty ranks and titles are described in the Duke University Faculty Handbook, Chapter 2. The elaboration that follows pertains specifically to standards and practices in the Fuqua School of Business. A faculty member in the School holds one of the tenure track or non-tenure track titles described below. Fuqua faculty are organized into academic areas with any changes to the number or composition of areas determined by faculty discussion and vote using the faculty meeting procedures outlined in section VI below and contingent on a positive majority amongst those voting by secret ballot in person or absentee. Each area will have an area coordinator appointed by the dean."

A. Tenure Track Appointments. Tenure track appointments carry the title of professor, associate professor, or assistant professor. All tenure-track faculty members must have a specific area affiliation at Fuqua. Some characteristics of these appointments and their incumbents are as follows:
1. Professor. Appointments to this rank will be with tenure. Persons holding this rank are expected to stand in competition with the foremost professors of similar rank in similar fields, and to exceed the standards expected of associate professors.
2. Associate Professor. Appointments to this rank may be with or without tenure. Persons holding this rank with tenure are expected to stand in competition with the foremost professors of similar rank in similar fields and to have substantial records of research accomplishment. Persons holding this rank without tenure are expected to have demonstrated a capacity for research accomplishment. Persons holding this rank, whether tenured or not, should contribute effectively to the School's objective of excellence in the education of others, be it in classroom performance, textbook writing, directing student research, program management, executive education, or other areas of importance to the Fuqua School.
3. Assistant Professor. Appointments at this rank are never tenured. Persons holding this rank are expected to show promise of qualifying for the rank of associate professor within five to eight years from the appointment as assistant professor.
4. It is a policy of the School that a full-time faculty member may not hold tenure track appointments at Duke for more than eight consecutive years, unless the member is awarded tenure. Leaves for which the Provost of Duke University explicitly grants tenure clock relief will not be counted towards this time period.

B. Non-tenure Track Appointments. Various types of term appointments may be used to attract to the Fuqua School faculty members to whom the tenure track ranks are not well suited. These appointments do not involve the expectation of tenure at a later date. The titles of such appointments can be tailored to the circumstances, but in no case should they be inconsistent in level with the system of tenure track titles nor should they be inconsistent with University nomenclature. Non-tenure-track appointments may occur in the following categories:
1. Regular-rank, non-tenure-track faculty are part of the voting faculty and are expected to participate fully in all faculty meetings, except those devoted to personnel matters involving tenure-track faculty. Consistent with Duke University policy, these faculty members may hold titles of professor of the practice (assistant, associate or full), research professor (assistant, associate or full), or clinical professor (assistant, associate or full). These
appointments do not exceed a five year term, though reappointments are possible (see section IV. below). All regular-rank faculty members (including non-tenure-track, regular rank faculty members) must have a specified rank (assistant, associate, or full) and an area affiliation at Fuqua.

2. Non-regular-rank non-tenure track faculty are not part of the voting faculty. These appointments can be honorary, eponymous in nature or compensatory positions to employ faculty to engage in instructional effort.
   a. Faculty may be offered courtesy or secondary appointments at non-regular-rank titles with no remuneration. These appointments are designed to establish academic relationships with individuals in fields complementary to the disciplines represented at Fuqua. These appointments will not exceed a one year term although reappointments are possible. They are subject to approval by the Fuqua faculty as outlined in section III.A. below. These faculty members may hold non-regular rank titles allowed by Duke University or they may hold secondary titles allowing the individual to append “and the Fuqua School of Business” to a current Duke title.
   b. Faculty may be hired to non-regular-rank positions for instructional purposes as needed without faculty approval. Consistent with Duke University policy, these faculty members may hold titles of adjunct (assistant, associate or full), lecturing fellow or senior lecturing fellow, scholar in residence, consulting professor or executive-in-residence. These faculty members are not part of the voting faculty. These appointments do not exceed a one year term though reappointments are possible (see section III.B. below).
   c. Individuals with primary appointments in units of Duke other than Fuqua and joint appointments in Fuqua are not members of the voting faculty. Joint appointments are those for which Fuqua agrees to share some financial remuneration with the unit representing the faculty member’s primary appointment. These appointments do not exceed a five year term although reappointments are possible. Consistent with Duke University policy, these faculty members may add “and the Fuqua School of Business” to their existing titles.

II. Search Procedures for New Tenure-Track Faculty
   A. With the approval of the Provost, and in consultation with the area coordinator(s) for the area(s) in which the search will concentrate (as determined by the faculty associate dean in consultation with the Dean), the Dean authorizes the initiation of a search for a new member of the faculty. Searches may be conducted by areas or by search committees. For area-conducted searches, the area coordinator will act as the chair of the search effort or appoint a chair. For other searches, the Dean or the faculty associate dean will appoint a search committee, specifying the chair of that committee.
   B. The area or search committee's responsibilities are to work with the faculty associate dean to:
      1. Inquire about the specific affirmative action goals for the School set by the University’s director of Equal Opportunity Affirmative Action
      2. Identify publications in which to advertise the search, draft an advertisement to be placed in these publications, and work with the Dean’s office to place the advertisement;
      3. Contact promising candidates for expressions of interest;
      4. Interview potential candidates at professional meetings and elsewhere;
      5. Narrow the list of candidates and, with the faculty associate dean's prior approval, invite the top candidates for on-campus interviews;
      6. Ensure that each candidate is scheduled for a formal, “job talk” workshop that is announced to the voting faculty at least one-week in advance. Such announcements will include instructions as to how to become part of an interview schedule and/or obtain the invited candidate’s resume for review.
III. Appointment Procedures for New Faculty Appointments and Recurring Short-Term (Non-Regular-Rank and Joint) Faculty Appointments

A. Non-regular-rank, non-tenure track, non-compensatory courtesy or secondary appointments may be conferred for a period of not more than one year. This process may be repeated in subsequent years following an initial appointment. The process is in all cases as follows. All voting faculty will be notified by the Dean’s office of the intent to make the appointment. This notification will include a brief rationale for the appointment and the candidate’s current CV. During the one-week period following this notification any voting faculty member may request a faculty meeting to discuss and vote on the appointment; absent a call for a meeting the proposed appointment will be accepted without a meeting. If one or more faculty member calls for a meeting, all members of the voting faculty will be eligible to vote using the meeting procedures outlined in section VI below and appointment is contingent on a positive majority amongst those voting by secret ballot in person or absentee.

B. Non-regular-rank, non-tenure track faculty may be hired without a faculty vote for contract periods not to exceed one year. These faculty members will be hired only for well-defined work (primarily staffing courses) that is not able to be accomplished by regular-rank faculty members. These contracts shall be consistent with needs and budgeting identified during the year-by-year teaching planning process. This process may be repeated in subsequent years.

C. Joint appointments involving remuneration from the Fuqua School must always be conditional on an initial review and vote by all faculty at or above the proposed rank, using the meeting procedures outlined in section VI. below and contingent on a positive majority amongst those voting by secret ballot in person or absentee. Appointment terms will not exceed five years. Subsequent reappointment is contingent on a positive majority amongst those voting by secret ballot in person or absentee following the review procedures in section IV below.

D. Regular-rank, non-tenure-track faculty with initial contracts not exceeding two years may be hired according to one of two processes. First, the Dean or faculty associate dean may call a meeting of all Fuqua voting faculty at or above the rank of the proposed appointment to discuss and vote on the appointment. A document containing the rationale for the appointment and the candidate’s current CV will be circulated at least one week in advance of this meeting. Alternatively, all voting faculty at or above the rank of the proposed appointment will be notified by the Dean’s office of the intent to make the appointment. This notification will include a brief rationale for the appointment and the candidate’s current CV. The relevant faculty members will then have a one-week period during which any of these faculty members may request a faculty meeting to discuss and vote on the appointment; absent a call for a meeting the proposed appointment will be accepted without a meeting. If one or more faculty member calls for a meeting, all members of the voting faculty at or above the rank being considered will be eligible to vote on the appointment, contingent on a majority positive vote of those voting. Contract renewal or extension will always be contingent on a majority positive vote of faculty voting following the faculty review procedures outlined in section IV below.

E. Regular-rank, non-tenure-track faculty with initial contracts of over two years in length must be hired according to the following procedure. The Dean or associate dean for faculty will call a meeting of all Fuqua faculty at or above the rank being considered for appointment. A rationale for the appointment and the candidate’s CV will be circulated at least one week before the meeting. Appointment is contingent on a majority positive vote by the Fuqua faculty who vote on the proposal using the meeting procedures outlined in section VI. below. Reappointment or contract extension will always be contingent on a majority positive vote of faculty voting following the faculty review procedures outlined in section IV below.

F. For appointments of tenure-track assistant professors to initial five-year terms, one of two processes will be used. First, the Dean or faculty associate dean may call for a meeting and vote of all Fuqua tenure-track faculty. A brief rationale for the appointment and the candidate’s current CV will be circulated to the tenure-track faculty at least one week in advance of this meeting. Alternatively, all tenure-track faculty will be notified by the Dean’s office of the intent to make the appointment. This notification will include a brief rationale for the appointment and the candidate’s current CV. Tenure-track faculty members will then have a one-week period during the
which any faculty member may request a faculty meeting to discuss and vote on the appointment; absent a call for a meeting the proposed appointment will be accepted. If one or more faculty member calls for a meeting, all members of the tenure-track faculty will be eligible to vote and appointment is contingent on a majority positive vote of faculty voting. The meeting will be conducted according to the procedures outlined in section VI. below. Contract extensions for assistant professors will follow the faculty review procedures outlined in section IV below.

G. For tenure track appointments to the faculty at the ranks of associate professor and professor, the process for formal faculty review and vote, delineated in section V., must be used.

IV. Time Line for Reappointment and Advancement of Regular-Rank Faculty and Joint Appointments

A. Time Line for Tenure-track Faculty Hired at the Rank of Assistant Professor
   1. Initial appointment is for five years conditional upon the faculty member having completed his or her graduate studies by the end of the second year. If the faculty member does not complete his or her PhD (or equivalent, if relevant) degree by the end of the second year of employment, his or her contract will terminate.
   2. Tenure clock starts running with employment date, with the customary date July 1. A formal review will generally be conducted by the spring of the fourth year. (An appropriate time shift will be implemented to address nontraditional contract start dates.) The faculty member, in consultation with his or her area coordinator, the faculty associate dean and the Dean may request an earlier review. This review will be led by an ad hoc committee appointed by the faculty associate dean to determine if the person is on the tenure vector, as specified in section V. below.
   3. Based upon the findings of the review, possible outside evaluations, and faculty discussion, the faculty will make one of three recommendations: that the appointment is renewed concurrent with a promotion to associate professor, that the appointment is renewed at the rank of assistant professor, or that the appointment is not renewed. Final decision for the promotion and/or appointment renewal rests with the Provost based upon the recommendation of the dean.
   4. Tenure review will typically occur by the fall of the penultimate contract year, usually the seventh year of employment but later if the provost has approved tenure clock relief.

B. Timeline for Consideration for Tenure: Tenure review will generally be conducted when contract deadlines dictate, i.e., during the fall of the penultimate contract year. A candidate may, in consultation with the faculty associate dean and his or her area coordinator, request an earlier consideration.

C. Timeline for consideration for promotion to full professor:
   1. Each year, the Dean and the faculty associate dean will call a meeting to review all faculty members who might be considered for advancement to full professor with the current group of full professors.
   2. Based on this review, followed by a discussion between the faculty member and the faculty associate dean, the faculty member determines whether he or she wishes to be considered formally for promotion to full professor during the current academic year.

D. Timeline for Reappointment and Advancement of Non-tenure Track Faculty Appointments. Contract extensions or promotions for regular-rank non-tenure-track faculty members and for joint appointments must be preceded by a review of the candidate's contributions to the Fuqua School by a faculty committee appointed for that purpose by the Dean or faculty associate dean. This committee will follow the process outlined in section V. below. These reviews will occur during the penultimate contract year. Contract terms for non-tenure-track faculty may never exceed five years.
V. Faculty Review and Meeting Procedures for Initial Appointment of Associate and Full Professors, for Promotion of Regular-Rank Faculty, for Reappointment of Regular-Rank and Joint-Appointment Faculty

A. All faculty members are expected to make reasonable contributions to the normal operations of the school and the Duke community. A demonstrated incapacity or unwillingness to do so disqualifies one for appointment, reappointment, or advancement.

B. The following review procedures are employed for renewal of regular-rank or joint-appointment faculty, promotion to associate or full professor and for the granting of tenure:

1. The faculty associate dean appoints an evaluation committee of faculty members, a majority of whom are from the School. All members of the evaluation committee are of the rank being considered for the faculty candidate, or a higher rank. If the candidate is being considered for a rank with tenure, all members of the evaluation committee are tenured.

2. Committees involving tenured candidates or candidates potentially advancing to tenure will be comprised of four members; committees involving appointment or renewal of untenured or non-tenure-track candidates will be comprised of three members.

3. The Dean’s office will request from the candidate a current resume, a statement of research interests and plans, copies of publications and manuscripts, names of people considered by the candidate to be qualified to appraise his or her scholarly work, and any other material the candidate considers relevant.

4. The review committee shall:
   a. Examine and comment on the scholarly work of the candidate;
   b. Recommend names for the faculty associate dean to solicit for evaluations of the candidate's scholarship; and
   c. Examine the teaching effectiveness of the candidate by reviewing student evaluations, consulting program director(s), reading or obtaining reviews of textbooks and case materials, and when possible, by other means; the committee should also examine course syllabi and any theses or dissertations supervised by the candidate;
   d. Consider the quantity and quality of service to the area, to the Fuqua school, to the University, and to the profession;
   e. Consider the candidate's success in obtaining research grants;
   f. Prepare and deliver to the Dean a written report of its opinion as to whether the candidate qualifies for the proposed action;
   g. Provide as part of that report a statement about the quality of the journals and publishers which have accepted work by the candidate and about the nature of scholarly productivity in the subject; this statement addresses such questions as whether excellent scholars in the discipline write articles rather than books, whether collaboration with other researchers is the norm, and, when feasible, how the responsibility for research is distributed among joint authors.

5. All faculty members at the rank being considered or higher will be eligible to attend the faculty meeting and vote on the personnel matter by secret ballot or to vote through absentee. In the case of contract renewal for assistant professors, assistant professors are not eligible to attend, as this renewal will involve possible promotion to associate professor.

6. Roberts Rules will be used in the meetings with a quorum defined as 2/3 of the eligible faculty either voting by absentee ballot or present in the meeting. If a quorum is not achieved, the personnel matter will be tabled and a new meeting will be called.

7. The report of the committee and its supporting documents are made available through the Dean's office only to faculty eligible to vote on the personnel matter. Approximately one week after these documents are made available, the faculty eligible to vote meet to discuss the committee’s recommendation. The recommendation, if moved and seconded, is then voted on by secret ballot.

8. The Dean or faculty associate dean notifies the candidate of the faculty vote, and provides the candidate with such details of the evaluation as seem helpful to the candidate, as soon as practicable after the meeting. As soon as practicable after candidate notification, the Dean or faculty associate dean also notifies all faculty members eligible to vote on the case of the outcome of the vote. The dean also notifies all faculty eligible to vote on the case of his or her recommendation. If the candidate chooses to end the process of evaluation and waive (in
writing) his or her right to further review, then notification of the faculty as to the vote is not necessary and instead the Dean or faculty associate dean will notify all faculty members eligible to vote on the case of the candidate’s decision to decline further review. The next step is contingent on rank

a. In the case of external appointment at untenured associate professor only, the Dean has authority to make the appointment given a majority positive vote by the faculty who vote on the matter.

b. In all other cases, the Dean, having knowledge of the committee report and the faculty discussion and vote, summarizes the deliberations, and formulates a written recommendation to the Provost including the reasons for the recommendation, the report and documents collected by the ad hoc review committee submitted to the Dean (including resume, publications, letters from colleagues, and statement of research interests and plans); and the tally of the faculty vote on the evaluation committee's recommendation.

VI. Faculty Meeting Procedures Contingent on Dean or Faculty Request for a Meeting for Initial Appointment of Assistant Professors, Non-Tenure-Track Regular Rank Faculty, and Courtesy Appointments

A. All faculty members at the rank being considered or higher will be eligible to attend the faculty meeting and vote on the personnel matter by secret ballot or to vote through absentee. In the case of contract renewal for assistant professors, assistant professors are not eligible to attend, as this renewal will involve possible promotion to associate professor.

B. Roberts Rules will be used in the meetings with a quorum defined as 2/3 of the eligible faculty either voting by absentee ballot or present in the meeting. If a quorum is not achieved, the personnel matter will be tabled and a new meeting will be called.

C. As soon as practicable, the Dean or faculty associate dean notifies all faculty members eligible to vote on the case of the outcome of the vote.

D. The Dean has the authority to make the appointment given a majority positive vote of the faculty who vote on the matter.

VII. Annual Faculty Evaluation Procedure

A. The faculty associate dean evaluates continuing faculty each year in an effort by the school to foster individual development, further the interests of the school, and determine faculty salary increases.

B. One objective of the Fuqua School is to achieve excellence in its faculty, either in research related to the management of complex organizations or in educational activities directed toward improving the competency of managers. The faculty as a group must cover both dimensions. While some individual faculty members will achieve excellence in both dimensions, every tenure track faculty member is expected to contribute at least at an acceptable level in the dimension in which he or she is considered less outstanding. A non-tenure track faculty member is expected to excel in either research or education.

The steps in the annual faculty evaluation process are as follows:

1. In January of each year, each regular rank faculty member submits, to the faculty associate dean, information about his or her activities in research, education, and service during the previous calendar year, and a current resume.

2. There follows an initial evaluation of each regular rank faculty member managed by the faculty associate dean, in consultation with area coordinators and relevant (depending on individual faculty teaching assignments) program deans or director(s). This evaluation involves:

   a. From the area coordinator: Assessment of the faculty member's contribution to educational programs, quality and quantity of research, and standing in the profession. For untenured faculty on tenure track appointments, progress toward tenure is an important consideration. For tenured faculty, important considerations are
i. standing in the profession as a scholar;
ii. contribution to the development of junior faculty, the academic programs, the school, and the university
b. As necessary, from the program director(s) and associate dean(s) for academic programs opinion and information regarding the member's:
   i. Contributions in terms of course development and delivery;
   ii. Value as a part of the educational program; and
   iii. Contribution to program development.
C. The faculty associate dean and the Dean review these evaluations and prepare faculty salary recommendations for the next fiscal year. The Dean may base these recommendations in part on consideration of the overall mix of faculty skills.
D. The dean or the faculty associate dean discusses each assistant or associate professor's progress with him or her each year. The faculty associate dean also conducts periodic reviews with full professors.
Faculty Bylaws

Article 1. Voting Faculty
The voting faculty, as defined by the university Faculty Handbook, comprises those full-time Duke University faculty members who hold a primary and regular rank non-visiting appointment in the Fuqua School of Business as professor, associate professor, assistant professor, professor of the practice (assistant, associate or full), research professor (assistant, associate or full), or clinical professor (assistant, associate or full) whether on a tenure or non-tenure track.

Article 2. Faculty Meetings
The faculty shall meet at least three times a year during the regular school session: once during September, once during January, and once during April at which time the Dean will report on the state of the school. Meetings will be called at other times as needed. Each member of the faculty shall be notified via email or writing of the date and time of any meeting at least one week prior to the meeting date. All meetings will be conducted in accordance with Robert's Rules of Order. For meetings requiring a vote, a quorum of votes from 2/3 of those eligible is necessary. The quorum is defined as the sum of faculty voting by absentee and faculty voting during the meeting.

Article 3. Hiring, Reappointment, Rank, Promotion, or Tenure
Matters concerning the hiring, reappointment, rank, promotion, or tenure of faculty will be handled in accordance with the policy and criteria for hiring and promotion stated in the Fuqua School of Business procedures handbook titled Faculty Evaluation, Appointment, Promotion, and Tenure: Criteria and Procedures. These procedures will in all cases be consistent with the rules governing faculty evaluation, appointment, promotion and tenure in the Duke University handbook. Decisions involving reappointment, promotion, and granting of tenure to current faculty members, or hiring of new tenured or tenure-track untenured associate faculty members will be discussed and voted on in faculty meetings convened for the purpose. Hiring of assistant professors or non-tenure-track regular rank faculty members will be discussed and voted on if faculty members call for a meeting within one week of being notified by the Dean’s office of a planned appointment. Attendance and voting privileges at the relevant faculty meetings will be limited to voting faculty with rank and tenure status at least equal to that being proposed. The Dean or faculty associate dean will preside at each of these meetings and will be responsible for the timely notification of action taken. All votes taken in these matters will be by secret ballot.

Article 4. Faculty Advisory Committee
The Faculty Advisory Committee composed of the Dean, any associate or deputy dean who is also a member of the tenure track faculty, and five elected members of the faculty shall be constituted for the purpose of serving as faculty representatives to consult with the Dean on general policies of administration and governance. Further, the committee is charged with advising the dean on the equity of criteria and procedures for faculty management and resource allocation across faculty members. The Dean shall serve as the chairperson of this committee. The elected membership of the committee shall be comprised of one member from each of the professorial ranks (assistant, associate and full professor), an elected faculty secretary and an elected at-large member. The term of office shall be for two years in duration beginning on October 1 following the September election for all members but the secretary and one year in duration for the faculty secretary. Election will be by secret ballot. Each position will be filled by plurality vote of the faculty for that position, with ties broken randomly. Vacancies where there is
at least one full semester to serve will be filled by election using the standard procedure. The Secretary of the Faculty Advisory Committee will inform the faculty of all matters discussed at meetings of the Faculty Advisory Committee by submitting minutes to the faculty within two weeks of the meeting. The secretary of the faculty will be responsible for calling a meeting of the voting faculty on any matter, should two members of the faculty request such a meeting.

**Article 5. Curriculum Committee**

A ten-person Curriculum Committee shall be appointed by the Dean or faculty associate dean each September and shall be constituted for the purpose of monitoring curricula of all Fuqua degree granting programs, suggesting and evaluating new curricula and programs, enforcing continuation requirements and other issues of class standing, and overseeing other activities directly related to the substantive content and pedagogy of the school's educational programs. Five of the ten members shall be from the voting faculty, two members shall be students in the daytime MBA program (one first year and one second year), two members shall students in Executive MBA programs and one member shall be an MMS student.

All members of the Curriculum Committee shall be eligible to vote on curricula and program matters. Faculty members shall each have one vote and student members shall each have one-half vote. Only faculty members of the Curriculum Committee will meet and vote on questions of student standing. Following the meetings of the Curriculum Committee, minutes of the meetings, including recommended curriculum and course changes, will be provided to the faculty by the chairperson of the committee. Recommended curriculum and course changes can be challenged if two members of the faculty, within one scheduled academic week after the minutes are circulated to the faculty, request a faculty meeting to discuss or decide these issues. All motions to be voted on at such meetings must be submitted in writing to the Dean’s office at least one week in advance of the meeting. Votes during such meetings will be by secret ballot.

**Article 6. Faculty Grievance Committee**

A faculty Grievance Committee shall be convened as needed to investigate a faculty member's grievance. The Committee shall review the faculty member's grievance and make a recommendation to the Dean concerning the merits of the grievance. The committee shall be composed of three members: one selected by the Dean, one selected by the aggrieved faculty, and a chairperson selected by these two members. These procedures should not be understood to in any way dissuade or prohibit a faculty member from making use of Duke University’s procedures for pursuing grievances, including use of the University Faculty Ombuds and grievance procedures as stipulated in the University Faculty Handbook.

**Article 7. Administration**

The Dean is responsible for the leadership, management, and administrative structure of the School. The Dean shall appoint administrative officers as necessary to assist in conduct of these responsibilities:

- Attract and maintain a faculty of world-wide preeminence,
- Stimulate the development of educational and research programs to meet the school's objectives,
- Represent the school to the University, the business community, other educational institutions, and the public at large,
- Direct the school's financial affairs and budget.
Direct with the cooperation of the University and the Fuqua faculty, a fund-raising program to meet the needs of the school.

Article 8. Student Body
The student body of the Fuqua School of Business shall include students enrolled in the various academic programs of the school. Each program group shall determine its own organization and work with the faculty and administration to determine its own involvement and influence in school affairs.

Article 9. Amendments
The articles of governance may be amended by three-fifths of the voting faculty in a regular called meeting of the faculty. Any proposed amendments must be circulated in writing to each member of the voting faculty at least two scheduled academic weeks prior to the meeting at which the change will be considered. Votes will be by secret ballot. Online, anonymous absentee ballot votes may be submitted prior to the meeting.